

July 2009 *MoneyMinute* – “VIP” Stocks go M-I-A

Many of you have read about how Warren Buffett invests – buying a limited number of companies and watching them very closely. Occasionally you will see an article about investing in a few stocks is a better way to invest than by being widely diversified.

A recent article from Dimensional Funds Advisors mentions a study done by a magazine in Australia that looked at the issue.

By Jim Parker

Regional Director, DFA Australia Limited

One of the great myths of the investment world is that you can build a successful long-term strategy around a carefully chosen small number of stocks that are perceived as generating good earnings growth year after year.

Just why this myth refuses to die may be a testament to the power of hope over experience. But it's useful now and then to see the dire results of concentrated portfolios, even those chosen by supposed experts.

In mid-2007, the Australian Financial Review's Smart Investor magazine published a front cover story called 'VIP Stocks — 25 Companies that Grow Earnings Year after Year'.¹ The 'VIP' tag in this case stood for 'Very Impressive Performers' and was accompanied by a rather nifty photograph of what looked like a backstage pass.

The implication was that this was the portfolio favoured by insiders. The blue ribbon stocks were chosen after analysts "pored through consensus earnings forecasts for Australia's top 500 listed companies" to find the 25 that they agreed had the best potential in terms of earnings per share (EPS) growth.

This was a detailed and rigorous process, we were told. To ensure the chosen stocks were not "just a flash in the pan", the magazine's analysts insisted on a superlative track record. The companies had to have had at least double-digit EPS growth in both the 2005 and 2006 financial years, as well as "a top earnings outlook" for either 2007 or 2008.

To ensure the companies were generating earnings efficiently, the analysts required that each stock had a return on equity of at least 12 per cent. And to cover the risk that all the good news was priced in, they excluded any company with a price-earnings ratio "wildly above" the industry average.

So given these high hurdles, it would seem reasonable to expect that Australia's top analysts would create a small portfolio that would shoot the lights out, or at least outperform the market, wouldn't you think?

Unfortunately not. Of the 25 "very impressive performers" for 2008, only a mere seven (or less than a third) ended up performing better than the market, as defined by the S&P/ASX-300 Accumulation Index. They were Sonic Healthcare, Computershare, TechnologyOne, IBA Health, Iress Market Technology, Beach Petroleum and JB Hi-Fi.

On the flipside, 18 of the 25 underperformed the market. And of those, 12 lost 60 per cent or more of their value. In fact, the two worst performers in the magazine's list of "VIP" stocks went missing in action altogether. Investment companies Allco Finance Group and Babcock & Brown imploded over 2008 and now are no longer listed.

Overall, if you had decided to put your own money into this concentrated, "rigorously analysed" portfolio of Australian stocks last year, you would have generated an average return of a negative 58.58 per cent, against a negative 38.90 per cent return just by owning the market. And this is even before taking brokerage costs into account.

It should be clear from this that when you hold such a concentrated portfolio you are taking on unnecessary risk. You expose yourself to stock specific and industry factors that can blow your portfolio out of the water.

The fact is it doesn't matter how well those individual stocks have performed up until that point. More often than not, their superlative past performance is recognised by the market and is reflected in prices.

When it comes down to it, investment is about what happens next. We don't know what happens next. And that's why we diversify.

(Jim Parker would like to thank Rob Brown for his assistance with this article)

¹'VIP Stocks', *Financial Review Smart Investor*, June 2007

This material may refer to resident trusts offered by DFA Australia Limited. These resident trusts are only available in Australia. Nothing in this material is an offer or solicitation to invest in these resident trusts or any other financial products or securities. All figures in this material are in Australian dollars unless otherwise stated.

Dimensional Fund Advisors ("Dimensional") is an investment adviser registered with the Securities and Exchange Commission. The material in this publication is provided solely as background information for registered investment advisors and institutional investors, and is not intended for public use.

This article contains the opinions of the author but not necessarily the opinions of Dimensional. The opinion of the author is subject to change without notice. All materials presented are compiled from sources believed to be reliable and current, but accuracy cannot be guaranteed. This article is distributed for educational purposes, and it is not to be construed as an offer, solicitation, recommendation, or endorsement of any particular security, products or services described in this website.

© 2009 Dimensional Fund Advisors. All rights reserved. Unauthorized copying, reproducing, duplicating, or transmitting of this material is prohibited. Used with permission.

If you have friends who may benefit from the monthly *MoneyMinute*, please forward this to them. To sign up for your own copy: <http://www.feesonly.com/moneyminute.html>

The articles page on our website covers planning issues from real estate to long-term care, from investment risk to college funding, and more. See the rest at: <http://www.feesonly.com/Articles.html>.

At Investor's Capital Management, LLC, we are independent fee-only financial planners and investment managers. We do not take product commissions, nor do we gain from any portfolio activity. A client's fee is the only payment we receive, so that we work solely in their best interests. As independent financial planners, we have a **fiduciary responsibility** to our clients to always put their best interests first. This may seem obvious to you, but in fact it is all too rare in the financial services area.

OUR MISSION:

Giving clients the clarity and confidence they need to make consistently sound choices. If we may be of assistance in any way during the weeks and months ahead, please call or email.

To maintain the quality of our service, we take on a limited number of new relationships each year. If we're not able to help someone who contacts us, we'll make sure to refer them to professionals we think highly of.

Learn more at our website: <http://www.feesonly.com>.

Rich Chambers, CFP®

Julie Schatz, CFP®

Jennifer Cray, CFP®

Investor's Capital Management, LLC, Menlo Park

Offering Unbiased Guidance to Financial Success

Member of the National Association of Personal Financial Advisors (NAPFA)

Phone: 866-966-9291

Fax: 650-472-8924

info@feesonly.com <http://www.feesonly.com>

Legal Disclaimer: Investor's Capital Management, LLC <http://www.feesonly.com>, and the *MoneyMinute* email does not render or offer to render personalized investment advice or financial planning advice through this free service. This service is limited to the dissemination of general information only. For specific financial advice you must enter into a formal relationship with a financial adviser.